## An Exact Branch and Bound Algorithm

with
Symmetry Breaking

# for the <br> Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem 

Ciaran McCreesh Patrick Prosser

February 11, 2014

## Maximum Balanced Induced Bicliques

## Bicliques



The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## Induced Bicliques



## Balanced Bicliques



## The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem



## The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem



The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## Existing Results

## Complexity

■ NP-hard, even in a bipartite graph (Garey and Johnson).

## Other Biclique Variants

- Maximum vertex non-induced biclique:

■ Trivially useless.
■ Maximum vertex biclique in a bipartite graph:

- Easy (König's theorem and bipartite matching).

■ Corollary: maximum clique for a union of two cliques is easy.
■ Maximum vertex induced biclique in an arbitrary graph:
■ NP-hard

- Applications in data mining.

■ Maximum edge induced biclique in a bipartite graph:

- NP-hard
- Applications in data mining.


## Applications

## Why Care?

- Interesting algorithmic properties:

■ Non-hereditary, but still reasonably well-behaved.

- We have a good bound.

■ One simple symmetry.

## Our Algorithm

## Inspiration

■ Maximum clique algorithms by Tomita et al.
■ Bitset encodings by San Segundo et al.

- A speedup of between two and twenty for maximum clique.


## Branch. . .

■ Recursively grow two compatible independent sets, $A$ and $B$.
■ Have two candidate sets, $P_{a}$ and $P_{b}$.

- Recursively expand:

■ Pick a vertex $v$ from $P_{a}$, add it to $A$.

- So we must remove adjacent vertices from $P_{a}$, and non-adjacent vertices from $P_{b}$.
- Now recurse, swapping the roles of $A$ and $B$.
- Then consider removing $v$ from $A$ and $P_{a}$.


Ciaran McCreesh
The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## ....and Bound

- Keep track of the best solution found so far, $\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right)$. We call this the incumbent.
■ Careful! The balance condition means feasibility is not quite hereditary. At leaf nodes, either $|A|=|B|$ or $|A|=|B|+1$.
■ If $|A|+\left|P_{a}\right| \leq\left|A_{\max }\right|$, or $|B|+\left|P_{b}\right| \leq\left|B_{\max }\right|$, then we cannot unseat the incumbent, so we backtrack.
■ A much better bound can be found using clique covers.


## A Bound using Clique Covers

■ If we can colour a graph using $k$ colours, it cannot contain a clique with more than $k$ vertices (each vertex in a clique must be given a different colour).
■ Dually, if we can cover a graph using $k$ cliques, its independence number is at most $k$.

## A Bound using Clique Covers



## A Bound using Clique Covers



## A Bound using Clique Covers



## A Bound using Clique Covers



## A Bound using Clique Covers

- We use a greedy clique cover.
- Vertices are permuted at the top of search, for a static variable ordering.
- We only need to perform one clique cover per recursive call, not one per vertex selection.


## Dealing with Bipartite Graphs

- This bound knows about independent sets on each side, but not about compatibility.
- This bound is useless if the graph is bipartite, or becomes bipartite during search.
■ We can detect this: a greedy clique cover uses $k$ cliques iff the input is an independent set.
- Open problem: find a bound for this case which is both useful and quick to compute.


## Symmetries

## $(A, B) \cong(B, A)$

## Symmetries



## Ciaran McCreesh

The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## Symmetries



## Ciaran McCreesh

The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## Excluding Symmetries

## (1) (2) (3) <br>  <br> 


(1) (2)
(4)
(5) (6) 7
(8)
(9)

## Excluding Symmetries

(1) (2) 3
(4)
(5)
(6) 7
(8)
(9)
(1)
(2)
(3)
(4)
(5)
(6) 7
(8)
(9)
$\xrightarrow{\sim}$
(1)
(2)
(3)
(4)
(5)
(6) 7

(9)
(1) (2) (3) (4) 5) (6) 7) 8) (9)

Ciaran McCreesh
The Maximum Balanced Induced Biclique Problem

## Excluding Symmetries

|  | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
|  | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

## Excluding Symmetries

|  | 1 | 1 | 1 | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\geq_{\text {lex }}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | $\mathbf{0}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | $\mathbf{0}$ |



| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

$\leq_{\text {lex }}$
$1 \quad 1 \quad 1$
0
0
0
0
0
0

## Excluding Symmetries using Lex

■ Idea: only find solutions $(A, B)$ where $A \geq$ lex $B$.

- Don't swap the roles of $A$ and $B$ when recursing for the purposes of this test.
- We remove half of the solutions (not half of the search space).
- If we can prove that $B \geq_{\text {lex }} A$ must hold based upon the decisions made so far, backtrack.
- The most significant set bit in $A$ must be more significant than the most significant bit set in $B$.
- If the first $k$ bits of $A$ are zero, then the first $k$ bits of $B$ must be zero.


## Excluding Symmetries: What Could Possibly Go Wrong?

■ We may have to explore deep into the search tree before the rule kicks in: so long as the most significant bit is undecided, we can't filter anything.
■ Worse, we may exclude a solution which we would otherwise find quickly.

## Excluding Symmetries, Second Attempt

- We have fixed an arbitrary order for the bits. This order may not be the same as the decision order.
■ Idea: allow the algorithm to select the arbitrary order for the lex comparison.
- So we select the most significant bit first.

■ When we reject a vertex $v$ from $A$, if $B$ is empty, then reject $v$ from $P_{b}$.

## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad / /\) Consider \(v \in A\)
                    \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
                    \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{N_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
                    \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap N_{G}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
                if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                    \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / /\) We've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(\left.B_{\text {max }}\right)\)
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow \operatorname{order}[i]\)
                \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad\) // Consider \(v \in A\)
                    \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
                    \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{\mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
                \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{G}}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
                if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) then
                    \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / / \mathrm{We}\) 've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
    for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad / /\) Consider \(v \in A\)
                    \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
                \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{N_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
                \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap N_{G}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
                if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                        \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / /\) We've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                    \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
        // Now consider \(v \notin A\)
    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\}\)
                    \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
                    \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{\mathrm{a}} \cap \overline{\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{G}}(v)}\)
                    \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{G}}(v)\)
if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                        \(\left(A_{\text {max }}, B_{\text {max }}\right) \leftarrow(A, B)\)
                            if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                        \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                            \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad / /\) Consider \(v \in A\)
            \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
            \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{\mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
            \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap N_{G}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
            if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / /\) We've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                    \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad / /\) Consider \(v \in A\)
                    \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
            \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{N_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
            \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap N_{G}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
                if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                    \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / /\) We've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / /\) Swap and recurse
                    \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\}\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## Excluding Symmetries, with Two Lines of Code

```
expand :: (Graph \(G\), Set \(A\), Set \(B\), Set \(P_{a}\), Set \(P_{b}\), Set \(A_{\max }\), Set \(B_{\max }\) )
begin
(bounds, order) \(\leftarrow\) cliqueSort \(\left(G, P_{a}\right)\)
for \(i \leftarrow\left|P_{a}\right|\) downto 1 do
            if bounds \([i]+|A|>\left|A_{\max }\right|\) and \(\left|P_{b}\right|+|B|>\left|B_{\max }\right|\) then
                \(v \leftarrow\) order \([i]\)
                            \(A \leftarrow A \cup\{v\} \quad / /\) Consider \(v \in A\)
            \(P_{a} \leftarrow P_{a} \backslash\{v\}\)
            \(P_{a}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{a} \cap \overline{N_{\mathrm{G}}(v)} \quad / /\) Remove vertices adjacent to \(v\)
            \(P_{b}^{\prime} \leftarrow P_{b} \cap N_{G}(v) \quad / /\) Remove vertices not adjacent to \(v\)
                if \(|A|=|B|\) and \(|A|>\left|A_{\text {max }}\right|\) then
                    \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(A, B) \quad / /\) We've found a better solution
                if \(P_{b}^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) then
                \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, B, A, P_{b}^{\prime}, P_{a}^{\prime}, B_{\max }, A_{\max }\right) \quad / / \mathrm{Swap}\) and recurse
                    \(A \leftarrow A \backslash\{v\} \quad / /\) Now consider \(v \notin A\)
                    if \(B=\emptyset\) then
                        \(P_{b} \leftarrow P_{b} \backslash\{v\}\)
                                    // Avoid symmetric solutions
```


## The Rest of the Algorithm

```
improvedBiclique :: (Graph G) \(\rightarrow\) (Set of Integer, Set of Integer)
begin
    \(\left(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right) \leftarrow(\emptyset, \emptyset)\)
    permute \(G\) so that the vertices are in non-increasing degree order
    \(\operatorname{expand}\left(G, \emptyset, \emptyset, \mathrm{~V}(G), \mathrm{V}(G), A_{\max }, B_{\max }\right)\)
    return ( \(A_{\max }, B_{\max }\) ) (unpermuted)
cliqueSort :: (Graph G, Set P) \(\rightarrow\) (Array of Integer, Array of Integer)
begin
    bounds \(\leftarrow\) an Array of Integer
    order \(\leftarrow\) an Array of Integer
        \(P^{\prime} \leftarrow P \quad / /\) vertices yet to be allocated
        \(k \leftarrow 1 \quad / /\) current clique number
        while \(P^{\prime} \neq \emptyset\) do
            \(Q \leftarrow P^{\prime} \quad / /\) vertices to consider for the current clique
            while \(Q \neq \emptyset\) do
                            \(v \leftarrow\) the first element of \(Q \quad / /\) get next vertex to allocate
                            \(P^{\prime} \leftarrow P^{\prime} \backslash\{v\}\)
                            \(Q \leftarrow Q \cap N(G, v) \quad / /\) remove non-adjacent vertices
                    append \(k\) to bounds
                    append \(v\) to order
                \(k \leftarrow k+1 \quad / /\) start a new clique
    return (bounds, order)
```


## The Rest of the Algorithm

```
improvedBiclique :: (Graph G) }->\mathrm{ (Set of Integer, Set of Integer)
begin
(A ( max },\mp@subsup{B}{\operatorname{max}}{})\leftarrow(\emptyset,\emptyset
permute G so that the vertices are in non-increasing degree order
expand(G,\emptyset,\emptyset,V(G),V(G), Amax , B (max )
```



```
cliqueSort :: (Graph G, Set P) }->\mathrm{ (Array of Integer, Array of Integer)
begin
bounds }\leftarrow\mathrm{ an Array of Integer
order }\leftarrow\mathrm{ an Array of Integer
P
k\leftarrow1
while }\mp@subsup{P}{}{\prime}\not=\emptyset\mathrm{ do
Q}\leftarrow\mp@subsup{P}{}{\prime}\quad// vertices to consider for the current cliqu
while Q\not=\emptyset do
v}\leftarrow\mathrm{ the first element of Q // get next vertex to allocate
P'}\leftarrow\mp@subsup{P}{}{\prime}\{v
Q\leftarrowQ\capN(G,v) // remove non-adjacent vertices
append k to bounds
append v}\mathrm{ to order
k\leftarrowk+1 // start a new clique
    return (bounds, order)
```


## The Rest of the Algorithm

```
improvedBiclique :: (Graph G) }->\mathrm{ (Set of Integer, Set of Integer)
begin
(A Amax},\mp@subsup{B}{\operatorname{max}}{})\leftarrow(\emptyset,\emptyset
permute G so that the vertices are in non-increasing degree order
expand(G,\emptyset,\emptyset,V(G),V(G), Amax , Bmax )
return ( }\mp@subsup{A}{\mathrm{ max }}{},\mp@subsup{B}{\mathrm{ max }}{})\mathrm{ (unpermuted)
cliqueSort :: (Graph G, Set P) }->\mathrm{ (Array of Integer, Array of Integer)
begin
    bounds \leftarrow an Array of Integer
    order }\leftarrow\mathrm{ an Array of Integer
    P'}\leftarrowP // vertices yet to be allocate
    k\leftarrow1
        while }\mp@subsup{P}{}{\prime}\not=\emptyset\mathrm{ do
            Q}\leftarrow\mp@subsup{P}{}{\prime
        while Q\not=\emptyset do
            v}\leftarrow\mathrm{ the first element of Q
            P
            Q\leftarrowQ\capN(G,v) // remove non-adjacent vertices
            append }k\mathrm{ to bounds
            append v to order
            k\leftarrowk+1
```

            return (bounds, order)
    
## Results

## Results

- We can solve all but four DIMACS problems in under a day.

■ Usually, but not always, easier than maximum clique.
■ Usually, but not always, easier than maximum independent set.

- Large sparse graphs with $|V|>15,000$ and $|E|>250,000$ take under 20 seconds.
- Excluding symmetries gains us between $0 \%$ and $50 \%$.


## Results

- We can solve all but four DIMACS problems in under a day.

■ Usually, but not always, easier than maximum clique.
■ Usually, but not always, easier than maximum independent set.

- Large sparse graphs with $|V|>15,000$ and $|E|>250,000$ take under 20 seconds.
- Excluding symmetries gains us between $0 \%$ and $50 \%$.

■ Unless you look closely...

- The bound function can get worse for subproblems ("misleading"), and is not invariant under isomorphism ("evil"). Occasionally this gives wild results.


## Future Work

## Is an Algorithm Worth It?

- A naïve constraint programming model is easy, but slow.

■ What about a better constraint programming model?
■ What about MIP?

## Random Graphs G(250, x)



## Difficulty of $G(250, x)$



## Effects of Symmetry Exclusion in $G(250$, x)



## Parallel Branch and Bound

- For maximum clique, parallel branch and bound typically gives us close to linear speedups, and sometimes much better.
- We do the same here. But how do symmetries interact with parallelism?
http://dcs.gla.ac.uk/~ciaran
c.mccreesh.1@research.gla.ac.uk

